The context for this article is provided in the memoirs of the Reverend Anson Green, dd (1801–79). Green was a pioneer Methodist circuit preacher and later the book steward of the Wesleyan Methodist Book Room in Toronto, forerunner of the Ryerson Press and the United Church of Canada Publishing House. According to Green, in 1824 the village of Cobourg, population one hundred, consisted of 'two small stores ... several mechanics [i.e., workshops], and plenty of taverns.' The one church was Anglican; the Methodists met in the local schoolhouse. The same year Green records that he delivered the 'first sermon preached in Port Hope by a Wesleyan minister.' Port Hope was Cobourg's sister village, about ten kilometres west along the shore of Lake Ontario. The two were shortly to grow into sizeable lake-port towns situated about a hundred kilometres east of Toronto; their populations today are approximately twelve thousand for Port Hope and fifteen thousand for Cobourg. That historic 1824 sermon took place in a shoemaker's shop and attracted a congregation of six. Port Hope, Green noted, 'is full of enterprise and spirit, but so full of whisky and sin that it bears the name of "Sodom."' But, returning in 1836 for the dedication of the Port Hope Methodist church, he exclaimed, 'What a marvellous change ...! Now we have a neat little church, well filled, and our morning collection amounted to fifty-three dollars.' In the meantime, at Cobourg, he had recorded in 1832 that the cornerstone of the Methodists' Upper Canada Academy was laid by 'Dr Gilchrist of Colborne,' and in June 1836 he was able to describe the opening ceremonies of this historic institution which was later to change its name to Victoria College, eventually relocating in Toronto as part of the University of Toronto (Green, 49–50, 58, 206–8).

Green's description excludes any mention of music, but apparently there was some. The Christian Guardian, official organ of the Methodist Episcopal Church in the Canadas, under the editorship of Egerton Ryerson and A.W. Smith, covered the Academy's dedication in detail. There we read: 'What added much to the interest of the services, was the attendance of Mr Mark Burnham, from Port Hope, with an excellent choir of vocal xxxx

This article originated as a talk given at the invitation of the music department of Brock University, St Catharines, Ontario, 16 November 2000.

and instrumental music, by whom some appropriate pieces of sacred harmony were most admirably performed[1].' This report is tantalizingly incomplete. What was the choir? – a church choir, a choral society, or perhaps a singing school group along the New England model (of which a number of examples existed in early Upper Canada)? What instruments made up the ensemble? What particular pieces did they perform? Were excerpts from Burnham's tunebook Colonial Harmonist, published by him at Port Hope just four years earlier, part of the...
program – including perhaps one or two tunes of Burnham's own composition? So far the answers have not emerged.

Burnham had introduced his volume by declaring, 'No musical treatise has hitherto been published in this Colony' (i.e., Upper Canada) ('Advertisement,' 3). Previous sacred-music compilations had appeared elsewhere in British North America – in New Brunswick, Nova Scotia, and Lower Canada (Quebec and Montreal) – but his claim was accurate. I want first to give a short identification of Burnham and then examine Colonial Harmonist in some detail.

The brothers Asa, Zacheus, and John Burnham, and their sister Hannah Burnham, later Choate, arrived from New Hampshire to settle near Amherst, Upper Canada, between 1797 and 1805. (In 1819, Amherst changed its name to Cobourg in honour of the Saxe-Coburg family to which Prince Albert, cousin and later husband of the young Queen Victoria, belonged.) Their younger brother Mark Burnham was born in Dunbarton, New Hampshire, in 1791, and followed the others to Amherst in 1812. In 1819 he married Sophronia Gilchrist, daughter of the 'Dr Gilchrist' who laid the Upper Canada Academy's cornerstone. The Gilchrists also came from New Hampshire, specifically from Goffstown, not far from Dunbarton. By 1830 Mark and his family had moved to Port Hope and he was established there as a merchant. He was also active as a music teacher and choir director, and, like the other family members, a prominent Anglican. He died in 1864, and is buried in St John's Anglican Cemetery in Port Hope. The Burnhams were successful in business and played leading roles in the social and political life of the region for several generations, and the family name is commemorated in main streets of both Cobourg and Port Hope. The Mark Burnhams' family home in Port Hope, Dunbarton Hall, built in 1857, was still standing in 2000, at 163 Walton Street[2].

In the spring of 1831, Mark Burnham inserted in the Christian Guardian what he called a 'Prospectus of a New Musical Publication':

The Subscriber [meaning himself] proposes to publish, by subscription, a Volume of sacred music, which will comprise a selection from the works of Handel, Haydn, Mozart, Arnold, Madan, Billings, Ravencroft [sic], Dr Croft, and other European and American authors; it will also contain Elementary Rules for the study of Vocal Music, and directions for the formation and conduct of a Choir.

It is believed that a work of this kind is much wanted in Canada; and in order to make this volume generally acceptable and useful, no pains or expence [sic] will be spared. It will be adapted to the use of all denominations of Christians, and will come from the press under the Patronage of the Lord Bishop of Quebec[3].

The publication appeared the following year, priced at five shillings a copy. Its non- or interdenominational appeal is again stressed on the title page (see figure 1). However, the promised notice of approbation from the Bishop of Quebec does not appear. One might have expected the Bishop of Toronto as the authority to be invoked, but York only became Toronto in 1834, and the creation of the diocese of Toronto, with John Strachan as its first bishop, had to wait until 1839. Meanwhile, the diocese of Quebec covered the immense (though sparsely populated) territory of both Lower
Title-page (Canadian Musical Heritage Society) and Upper Canada. Whether Burnham applied to Bishop Stewart and what the result of his application may have been are unsolved questions.

Colonial Harmonist resembles in many features the typical tunebook of England and the United States in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. Its oblong pages contain a short introductory primer on musical notation and sight-singing, followed by a series of musical numbers. First we find a collection of four-part tunes, with the main air in the tenor voice, underlaid with the first verse of the intended hymn or metrical psalm text (the other verses would appear in your hymnal or psalter, or you might have been expected to memorize them). In this instance there are 244 tunes, arranged in order of their metres. The standard metres were Common (the four-line text alternates lines of eight and six syllables), Long (four eight-syllable lines), and Short (six, six, eight, and six syllables). In Burnham's collection, 88 tunes designated 'l.m.' (Long Metre) are followed by 81 in 'c.m.' (Common) and 30 in 's.m.' (Short); and these are followed by 35 examples of tunes designed for texts in the not-so-standard metres, with names like Hallelujah metre and Particular (or Peculiar) metre. Another ten metrically miscellaneous tunes are interspersed as 'fillers' in the next section of the book. Here we have a short selection of more extended numbers – most of them defined as anthems.

Compared to the concerted anthems of Purcell or Handel, they are rather simple, intended for singing-school study rather than for performance by a trained choir in a service of worship. Two favourite oratorio choruses by Handel are, however, included, as well as a widely known choral adaptation of the instrumental 'Dead March' in another of his oratorios, Saul. Though trained choirs had a long association with services in cathedrals and other large urban churches, their appearance in parish churches in smaller centres was still quite rare at this period. Collections of 'sacred music' such as Colonial Harmonist were indeed directed just as much, perhaps more, towards choral circles, singing schools, and home music-making as towards formal church observances. Burnham offers 22 anthems; and for its final fifteen pages his compilation provides a series of chants for the main canticles of the Anglican service (a more specifically liturgical inclusion than any of the rest of the contents).

Comparing Colonial Harmonist to some of the widely known New England tunebooks by composers such as William Billings or Daniel Read – both of whom, by the way, are represented in the volume – we may recognize many similarities. The main differences? The collections of Billings and his colleagues regularly included a few secular numbers, but Burnham admits only pieces with sacred texts. The New England collections rarely provide a chant section like Burnham's, but they nearly always offer several fuguing tunes, whereas Burnham has none of the latter. The fuguing treatment called for imitation or overlap of the voices in the last line, or sometimes the last two lines, of an otherwise 'plain' tune. That is, while in a plain tune all voices follow the same rhythm and sing the syllables of text simultaneously, a fuguing tune varies this texture in an extended and often repeated end-section with the character of a miniature fugue. Here, despite increased musical stimulation, the overlapping of text-syllables results in a momentary jumble, which was the main objection raised by critics of the genre.

In the context of its time, Colonial Harmonist represents a decidedly eclectic anthology. Sturdy survivors of the earliest phases of Protestant psalmody appear, such as 'Old Hundred' from the

mid-sixteenth-century Huguenot Psalter, 'York' from the first English Psalter, and 'Dundee' from the Scottish Psalter of the early seventeenth century. Eighteenth-century popular favourites such as William Croft's tune 'St Ann's' (to a different text from the 'O God our help' with which it was later associated) and William Cowper's text 'There is a fountain fill'd with blood' (to a different tune from those to which it was later sung) exist alongside other standard tunes and texts from the period – the tunes by Handel, Arne, or Boyce, the texts by Watts, John Newton, or the Wesleys. It was a period on both sides of the Atlantic when metrical psalms were being rewritten and hymn texts with a more deeply personal view of religious experience were gaining acceptance, and Burnham reflects this. His choices have musically a number of distinct facets. First, from his New Hampshire roots, Burnham appears to have retained a fondness for the music of the 'first New England School,' also known as the 'Yankee tunesmiths.' Secondly he relates closely to the eighteenth-century parish-music favourites of England, as seen in his references to Handel, Haydn, Samuel Arnold, William Croft, and Martin Madan. But beyond these repertoires he reflects two relatively new strains, originating in the United States in the first decade of the nineteenth century. One is the beginnings of folk hymnody in compilations such as Jeremiah Ingalls's Christian Harmony of 1805 (while only one tune from the Ingalls work is included, its flavour is reflected in a further handful). The other is the movement towards reform of the New England style in the simpler and more classical manner espoused by Lowell Mason, Thomas Hastings, and others around 1820. Richard Crawford traces in an interesting essay the anticipations of this movement in various publications of the previous decade. It is odd (though not without parallels) to find the tunesmith style and the music of the reformers side by side in the same collection, since the latter aimed to annihilate the works of the former, which they considered examples of 'unscientific' musical composition.

William Billings is the only 'American author' mentioned in Burnham's prospectus; he was the most celebrated of the New Englanders, and Colonial Harmonist includes ten tunes as well as an anthem by him. Among the tunes is 'Chester,' often described as the battle hymn of the Revolution, with its text beginning 'Let tyrants shake their iron rod.' Burnham fits it to less incendiary words, 'Let the high heavens your songs invite.' Daniel Read, Timothy Swan, Oliver Holden, Samuel Holyoke, Jacob Kimball, and Andrew Law – other leading 'Yankee tunesmiths' – are represented by at least one tune each. Some of the tunes selected, for example Swan's 'China' and Read's 'Windham,' are among the best-known and most frequently reprinted tunes in this repertoire. But Burnham draws the line at fuguing tunes.

Burnham's preface (or 'Advertisement'), echoing his initial 'Prospectus,' promises that among the tunes 'will be found some from the works of the most approved European and American authors, as well as a variety of original tunes' (Colonial Harmonist, 3). Tunes by popular English hymnodists of the time such as Martin Madan, Samuel Webbe, Samuel Stanley, and James Leach, occur prominently. While these may be forgotten names, some of their tunes remain in use in hymnals of the 1990s. The 'European' heritage is further represented by examples credited to Handel, Haydn, Mozart, and even Beethoven. Part of the new emphasis on 'ancient music' had led to the practice of fitting religious texts to choral, operatic, and quite often also instrumental themes by these and other classical masters. The trend was well established before 1800 both in England and in the States by tunes adapted from Handel and Corelli such as 'Messiah' (the soprano air 'I know that my Redeemer liveth,' from Messiah) and 'Dunbar' (Corelli's Variations for violin on the traditional theme La Folia). William Gardiner's Sacred melodies, from Haydn, Mozart and Beethoven (1812–15) served to extend it. Whether
influenced from this or from other sources of the day, Colonial Harmonist incorporates one
tune derived from the slow movement of Beethoven's Violin Sonata Opus 23 and another
adapted from Zerlina's aria 'Batti, batti, O bel Masetto,' in Mozart's Don Giovanni, as well as
Haydn's song 'Gott, erhalte Franz den Kaiser' (on which he based the variations in his Quartet
Opus 76, no. 3), still a standard tune in many hymnals. Burnham's collection contains
altogether some twenty-two examples by 'European masters' (among them Steffani, Pleyel,
and Giardini, alongside the better-known Handel, Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven) in similar
adaptations.

Burnham flags alongside tune-titles in his volume eleven items reprinted by permission from
the Boston Handel and Haydn Society Collection of Sacred Music published in Boston in 1822.
Seven of these are tunes by Lowell Mason, the unacknowledged editor of that celebrated
collection. It was also the source for two other tunes by him, and for some of the classical
adaptations referred to; for these, no 'permission' is noted.

As with many local tunebooks, Colonial Harmonist also uses Mason's work as the model for its
fifteen-page 'Introduction.' The theoretical or 'how-to' primer was a standard inclusion in
this literature. Comparing Burnham's to its Boston source, we find both similarities and
differences. This section in Colonial Harmonist takes about half the number of pages of the
equivalent in the Boston Handel and Haydn Society Collection (thirteen compared to twenty-
four pages). Both refer to the lowest of the four vocal parts as the 'base' rather than 'bass';
both use the standard terms for note-values (semibreve, minim, crotchet, quaver) rather than
the North American terms (whole note, half note, quarter note, eighth note). Colonial
Harmonist cites the old solmization syllables in a footnote ('Faw, Sol, Law, Faw, Sol, Law,
Mee'), but the reform-minded Boston Collection does not. Colonial Harmonist words its
definitions of major and minor scales differently from the Boston Handel and Haydn Society
Collection, and considerably revises the latter's account of intervals and interval-inversions. In
some respects Colonial Harmonist's treatment is the fuller of the two: where the Boston
Handel and Haydn Society Collection gives two illustrations of 'Modulation,' Colonial Harmonist
provides six; and of the sixty-seven definitions in the former's 'Explanation of Musical Terms,'
Colonial Harmonist deletes eight but adds more than thirty new ones. Thus this portion of
Colonial Harmonist may be described as based on, but not slavishly copied from, the Boston
publication.

The same comment in fact summarizes their relationship. Ninety-three of Burnham's 244
tunes are also found in the Boston Handel and Haydn Society Collection. But close comparison
reveals that in most if not all cases the versions are different. Both volumes include 'Vienna,'
the Beethoven slow-movement adaptation referred to above, but where the Boston Handel
and Haydn Society Collection's version is in E flat, Colonial Harmonist's is in E; moreover
Colonial Harmonist replaces some of the Boston Collection's (and Beethoven's) eighth-note
rests with sustained dots, at one point takes a plainer view of the latter's secondary
diminished-seventh, and provides different lines for the upper two voices in the four-part
harmonization. Again, in the 'Emperor's Hymn' setting (which both collections refer to as
'Westborough'), while the two give Haydn's air almost identically, Colonial Harmonist's bass
line shows a number of small differences and its two upper parts hardly resemble those in the
Boston Handel and Haydn Society Collection at all. Applied to a cross-section of about eighteen
tunes found in both collections, the comparison shows close similarities in the main airs, but
many adjustments in the settings: often the Burnham version is less ornamented and less
chromatic than the Boston version, and almost always the upper voices are rearranged, as if Burnham had a choir director's practical sense of what his trebles and 'second trebles' (as Colonial Harmonist calls the altos) were capable of.

What other publications influenced Burnham, besides the Boston collection? One likely source was Musica Sacra, 1819. Fifty-three of its tunes turn up in Colonial Harmonist, among them several seen also in the Boston Handel and Haydn Society Collection. Again, a cross-sectional comparison reveals no exact copying. Burnham sometimes gives the tune a different key or a different metrical unit (3/4 instead of 3/2, for example), and, while his version of the air sometimes corresponds to that in Musica Sacra, his other voices never do. There is a practical explanation for this: in Musica Sacra the air is (exceptionally) in the treble, not in the tenor as in Burnham and in most tunebooks of the day.

Neither the Boston Handel and Haydn Society Collection nor Musica Sacra can, however, be posited as a source for the 'Yankee' content of Colonial Harmonist, since, as already observed, Mason and Hastings approached sacred music from a 'reform' standpoint. However, according to convincing recent evidence, Burnham owned the Stoughton Collection of Church Music, both in its fourth edition and in the supplement to its first. This work, compiled for the local musical society of Stoughton, Massachusetts, just south of Boston, in 1829, is a direct descendent of the singing-school activities of William Billings, and preserves many of the tunes of Billings and his 'tunesmith' confreres; seventeen of these are found in Colonial Harmonist. Another widely known compilation with strong representation of the Yankee school is John Wyeth's Repository of Sacred Music, whose first volume appeared in 1810 and may have been known to Burnham. This eclectic compilation, in shape-note notation, was followed by a second volume in 1813 with a more radical 'folk hymn' colouration. Thirty-two tunes from Wyeth's first volume, and an additional five from his second, are found in Colonial Harmonist. Some of these – for example Billings's 'Chester' and Swan's 'China' – appear in versions similar enough to have been copied, though even here there are small differences. In Billings's 'Lebanon,' Swan's 'Poland,' and a few other tunes, Burnham appears to disguise modality with a sharp leading-note, where in Wyeth's versions it is flat. Burnham was evidently not attracted by the shape-note system then gaining currency in the States; it in fact never became popular in Upper Canada.

Burnham's choices include 36 tunes of the 'core repertory' (Crawford, Core) – an inventory of the 101 tunes most often reprinted in North American tunebooks between 1760 and 1800. Burnham is credited as the composer of six tunes. When I first examined the collection, remembering that early compilers did not always acknowledge a tune's provenance, whether original or borrowed, I suspected another six tunes at least might be his. My guess was based on the local place-names assigned to these tunes. This is, however, an unreliable clue. Just as 'Frederickton' in Stephen Humbert's Union Harmony was thought by some researchers to be an original tune because of its local name, whereas it turns out to be a Lutheran chorale which received this title in England before Humbert borrowed it, so I was ready to credit Burnham with the tune appearing as 'Canada' in Colonial Harmonist (the first of many tunes with this name), whereas Temperley's Hymn Tune Index tells me it was composed in 1807 by William Arnold, under the name 'Daniel Street.' I now curb my eagerness to claim such unattributed tunes as 'Quebec Chapel,' 'Brockville,' 'Belville' [sic], and 'St Catharine's' as works by the
Both tunes recall the stately 3/2 rhythms of English eighteenth-century hymnody. The few melismas in 'Resurrection' (bars 11, 14, 15) lie mainly on up-beats, a characteristic of the New England school rather than the English. In this tune also, the downbeat of bar 13 is a deliberate 'open' fifth – another New England trait. More strikingly aligned with the 'Yankee' style, however, is 'Hermitage.' Here the wide-ranging tenor melody itself has a modal or 'natural-minor' flavour, the only raised leading-note occurring at the start of the last phrase; as well, the harmonies include not only open fifths (seven examples) but dissonant clashes that would be disallowed in conventional classical practice (bars 2, 10, 11, 12) and voice-leading by parallel perfect intervals that would equally be frowned on (bars 1–2, 13, 14, 14–15). These 'faults' in terms of European convention may also be heard as deliberate marks of style, as pointed out perceptively by Irving Lowens (Music, esp 283–84) and others.

The 1832 publication of Burnham's Colonial Harmonist has always been regarded as its only edition. The work had a fair circulation; for instance, it was used by the Children of Peace at Sharon, judging from a copy preserved in the Sharon Temple Museum (see Schau). But copies are now rarer than of its successor, Alexander Davidson's Sacred Harmony. The latter, produced in 1838 and rapidly taken up by the publication wing of the Methodist Church, proved outstandingly durable, undergoing more than a dozen editions, the last dated 1861. The relationship between the two books may require deeper study. Davidson, originally from Ireland, settled in the Cobourg–Port Hope district and was associated with the Methodist movement and its leaders Case, Green, and Ryerson[14]. He advertised his tunebook for the first time as early as 1829 but was forced to delay because of the slow response to the subscription appeal[15]. Meanwhile Burnham, perhaps (as has been suggested) with the financial support of his well-to-do older brother Zacheus, was able to see his work published (Lamb, 98–99). Davidson's collection eventually appeared not in Port Hope but in Toronto (formerly York, newly renamed); its choice of repertoire extends over a similar Anglo-American range as Burnham's: in the American department we find a few tunes by Lowell Mason and his fellow-reformer Thomas Hastings, and amid the heavy representation xxxxxxxx

Figure 2 Mark Burnham, 'Resurrection' (Colonial Harmonist, page 37) (Canadian Musical Heritage Society)

Figure 3 Mark Burnham, 'Hermitage' (Colonial Harmonist, page 67) (Canadian Musical Heritage Society)

from the 'tunesmiths' (Billings et al) are several well-known fuguing tunes. Whereas Burnham presents tunes in four parts with most basses at least partially figured, Davidson presents more tunes in three parts than in four, and does not use bass figures[16]. None of Burnham's original tunes appear in Davidson's collection. The two books show a common repertoire of fifty-six items (fifty-five tunes and one anthem); nevertheless the versions of the tunes often differ markedly, dispelling any idea that the two compilers worked together – though they could hardly not have known of each other's work. There are two different tunes titled 'Port Hope,' one in Colonial Harmonist and the other in Sacred Harmony; both turn out to be
current English tunes in Upper Canadian disguise: the former is 'Sabbath' by Thomas Jarman, 1811, and the latter 'Chillendon' by Thomas Clark of Canterbury, 1815.

Perhaps because of its early eclipse by Davidson's collection, Colonial Harmonist received practically zero recognition in other collections of the mid-century. Burnham's own tune 'Resurrection,' however, turns up in a geographically unexpected publication of the 1850s – the Psalmody Reformer, a small tunebook in letter notation produced in Halifax by a couple of u.s. entrepreneurs. The tune is quoted intact but the arrangement for three voices departs significantly from the original[17].

The only other known publication credited to Burnham as editor-compiler is The Seraph, a slim anthology of twelve anthems, published in Toronto in the year before his death. Composers represented are English worthies of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, among them Handel, Fawcett, and Leach. Described as 'Printed at the "Guardian Steam Printing Establishment,"' the volume may have originated in imported plates to which the editor's name was added.

New light on Colonial Harmonist appeared in the summer of 2000. When I called on Anne and Paul Burnham at their farm near Cobourg in August, I had hoped they might be able to help me with biographical data about Mark Burnham: Paul is a descendant of Mark Burnham's older brother Asa Burnham, and I had read with interest Anne's recent genealogical findings. They showed me a copy of Colonial Harmonist which they had acquired only the previous June. I was astonished to find within the familiar binding a 263-page compilation of which about 90 per cent is handwritten, on new pages pasted onto the stubs of the cut-away original pages; the title-page bears an ink inscription 'Second Revised Edition – With Additions and Improvements,' and the original date of 1832 has been altered in ink to read '1836' (see figure 4). The Burnhams had acquired at xxxxxxxx

Figure 4 Mark Burnham, compiler, Colonial Harmonist, manuscript 'mock-up' of projected second edition (Port Hope, 1836). Title-page (University of Toronto Library photographic services)

the same sale two other tunebooks – the Stoughton Collection in its 1831 edition, and its Supplement of 1829 – reinforcing the probability that these were models and sources for Mark Burnham; the Supplement is inscribed in ink, 'Mark Burnham his book,' and a note records that it was purchased in Boston[18]. Like Jesse Doan, director of the Sharon Silver Band at this period, Burnham may have been in the habit of making occasional trips to Boston to buy the latest published music. Colonial Harmonist was typeset in the u.s., and Boston is the likely centre (no credit line appears in the volume).

As a 'mock-up' of a projected revised edition of Colonial Harmonist, the Burnhams' copy is a significant new discovery inviting further study. Here I can only summarize its appearance and contents. The chart, figure 5, compares it with the original publication. Manuscript sources of tunebooks in the u.s. are understood to be rare[19], and this is the first to come to light in Canada, as far as I have been able to determine, which makes it in my judgment a unique and valuable document.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1832 publication</th>
<th>1836 Second-edition ms 'mock-up'</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>244 tunes</td>
<td>251 tunes (111 from '32 edition; 140 new)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22 anthems</td>
<td>28 anthems (7 from '32 edition; 21 new)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15 pages of chants</td>
<td>0 chants</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Tunes:**

- 78 pp, 1 tune/page: 78
- 2 pp, single tune: 1
- 77 pp, 2 tunes/page: 154
- 1 p, closed score, 2 tunes/page: 2
- 6 pp, closed score, 3 tunes/page: 18
- 164 pp, 253 tunes* 
- 83 pp, 28 anthems
- 16 pp, Intro

*2 tunes appear twice

[Sabbath (4–10s), Savannah]

**Original tunes by the compiler:**

- Cobourg
- Dunbarton
- Goffstown
- Hermitage
- Nelson
- Resurrection

Figure 5 Colonial Harmonist, summary of contents, comparing the 1832
The compilation is again strikingly eclectic, with two special features not found in the 1832 book: first, there are now four examples of fuguing tunes by well-known New Englanders, and, second, there are three choruses from Handel's Messiah, painstakingly hand-copied – a reminder that in the 1830s not every choir member possessed a printed vocal score of this work. The chant section found in the original volume is missing, and for some reason Burnham has reduced his own modest compositional presence by half: someone should have begged him to reconsider, at least in the case of the lovely modal tune 'Hermitage.' The introductory mini-treatise on theory is inserted in the 'mock-up' in its 1832 printed form, but there are several revisions, including a manuscript note concerning embellishments, which gives a brief glimpse of Burnham the teacher:

... musical Graces, however admissable, and desirable in Solo Singing ought notwithstanding to be used with great caution and circumspection for redundancy of ornament is ever a mark of bad taste. – But the use of them in full Harmony is pernicious, as violating both the Time and Harmony; and destroying that precision and simplicity so essential [sic] to the effect of the music. – Embellishments of this kind ought to be considered as an end or perfection in Singing, and are best learned of a Master of acknowledged taste and experience ... (Colonial Harmonist, manuscript 'mock-up,' 14)

Of the newly included tunes, six also occur in the Boston Handel and Haydn Society Collection, two in Ingalls's Christian Harmony, three in Musica Sacra, fourteen in the Stoughton Collection, and eight and three respectively in the two volumes of Wyeth's Repository of Sacred Music. In addition, the manuscript adds five 'core repertory' tunes to the thirty-six found in the original edition.

Titles, metrical indications, attributions, and musical directions (tempi, affective terms) are in a slanting script, while the text-underlay is in an upright script, perhaps in order to take up less space. Unlike earlier tunebooks, for 70 of its 251 tunes the 1836 collection supplies from two to six stanzas of text, rather than just one. (Colonial Harmonist 1832 contains just two such examples.) Another difference: the 'mock-up' is able to incorporate more tunes on fewer pages than the 1832 publication because twenty tunes are given in closed score, i.e., on two staves only, affording three tunes per page rather than its predecessor's one or two. Figures 6 through 12 show typical pages.
Figure 8 Colonial Harmonist, 1836 manuscript, page 65. At top, pasted over another tune, is 'Colchester' by Aaron Williams; it appeared on page 112 of the 1832 published collection. The lower tune, 'Miles Lane' by William Shrubsole, still sung to Edward Perronet's text 'All hail the power of Jesus' name,' is here supplied with a three-bar coda, 'Hallelujah, Praise the Lord.'

Figure 9 Colonial Harmonist, 1836 manuscript, page 108. Two 'short metre' tunes by u.s. 'reformers': 'Boylston' by Lowell Mason and 'Nebo' by Thomas Hastings. Neither appeared in the 1832 collection.

Figure 10 Colonial Harmonist, 1836 manuscript, page 119. Three tunes ('Market Street,' 'Lowell,' and 'Dover') appear in short score, each with full text rather than just one verse. Another exceptional feature: in all three tunes the main melody is in the treble part, not the tenor.

Figure 11 Colonial Harmonist, 1835 manuscript, page 127b. The tune 'Canada' appeared in the 1832 collection (page 77), but here again the counter part is written at pitch rather than an octave higher. The metre is designated as 'l.p.m.' (long peculiar metre), specified as six lines of eight syllables each. A pencil note adds 'Second Metre.' The composer is given as 'Dr Arnold': in the 1832 version, there is no composer attribution. The tune is William Arnold's 'Daniel Street.'

Figure 12 Colonial Harmonist, 1836 manuscript, page 178. Lowell Mason's 'Missionary Hymn,' composed in 1822, and usually associated with Reginald Heber's text 'From Greenland's icy mountains,' became one of the most popular tunes of the century. Its first published appearance in British North America was in the Harmonicon (Pictou, ns, 1836). Burnham did not include it in his 1832 collection.

A collection of the Choate family, now in the Trent University Archives (the Choates were near relatives of the Burnhams through Mark's sister Hannah), includes memorabilia relating to music and specifically to Mark. There are about thirty miscellaneous tunebooks, mostly from u.s. compilers and mostly from the mid-nineteenth century; there are flash cards printed in Peterborough for a singing school run by a Thomas Choate in Warsaw, Ontario, as late as 1894; there is a small manuscript dated 1824 stated to be in Mark's hand, containing fourteen tunes, all but three of which appear in Colonial Harmonist (one of the exceptions is a fuguing tune in three voices, 'Exhortation,' by S. Hibbard, 1796; see figure 13); and finally there is a copy of Colonial Harmonist with the single word 'Second' inked on the title-page (figure 14) and with many cut pages and half-pages as well as pencil and ink emendations and three manuscript additions, two of tunes included in the published volume and one of a tune included neither in it nor in what I have called the 'mock-up' of the second edition. Again further study is required before one can be sure that this is another attempted 'mock-up,' though it seems probable. If so, its 'new' aspect is not discernible, although one might surmise that the stubs of the cut-away pages were to allow for new tunes to be pasted in, in a similar manner to the manuscript 'mock-up.' The two documents, the one at the Trent Archives and the other belonging to the Burnham family, may be tentatively identified as two attempts at preparing a second edition of Colonial Harmonist, the one incomplete and the other nearly complete. Such evidence of the process of tunebook compilation has not previously surfaced in Canada.
That process would have called for disposing of such a handmade mock-up once the volume was set in type. The survival of these two examples may well be definitive proof that Mark Burnham's projected second edition of Colonial Harmonist did not see publication in 1836. As to why it never appeared, circumstances suggest that the imminence of the 1838 Sacred Harmony, together with the latter's strong church endorsement, amounted to overwhelming competition, leading to Burnham's discouragement and withdrawal. That, however, is speculation for which we so far lack documental support.

The terms 'harmonist' and 'harmony,' seen in the titles of the two Upper Canadian collections studied here – Burnham's Colonial Harmonist and Davidson's Sacred Harmony – recur repeatedly in the tunebook literature, from Billings's Continental Harmony, 1794, through Ingalls's Christian Harmony, 1805, to the Southern Harmony of William Walker, 1835. Well-known contemporaneous compilations with similar titles include The Village Harmony, Union Harmony, Philadelphia Harmony, The Harmony of Maine, The Massachusetts Collection of Sacred Harmony, Virginia Harmony, Kentucky Harmony, Missouri Harmony, Harmonia Americana, Harmonia Sacra, The Harmonicon, The New Brunswick Church Harmony, and many others. 'Harmony' is here applied not in the sense that Wagner or Debussy or Gershwin understood it, as the technique of chord progressions. Rather it assumes the meaning of agreement or accord; the reference is to the agreeable joining-together of voices, reflecting the titles of two influential Wesleyan collections published in England – Harmonia Sacra, 1754, and Sacred Harmony, 1780. The widespread popularity of tunebooks in this period is as much a social phenomenon as a religious or musical one. Congregational song was a means of uniting the community in a valued (if perhaps momentary) 'harmony.' When regarded in such a socio-cultural context, the book compiled by Mark Burnham takes on more than local or regional significance.

Postscript: In May 2001, following negotiations with the Burnhams, the 1836 manuscript of Colonial Harmonist was acquired by the Thomas Fisher Rare Books Library of the University of Toronto Library. It will now be available for study by future researchers.

WORKS CITED


Burnham, Anne. 'Burnhams – A to Z.' Paper for the Cobourg and District Historical Society, 22
Burnham, Mark, compiler. Colonial Harmonist. Port Hope, Upper Canada 1832


Davidson, Alexander, compiler. Sacred Harmony. Toronto 1838, and ca 12 later editions, to 1861


Green, Anson. The Life and Times of the Rev. Anson Green, D.D., by himself. Toronto 1877


Ingalls, Jeremiah, compiler. The Christian Harmony. Exeter, nh 1805; facsimile repr New York: Da Capo 1979 (Earlier American Music 22)


Lowens, Irving. Introduction to repr of Wyeth, Repository of Sacred Music, Part Second

Muscica Sacra: or Springfield and Utica Collections United. Compiled by Thomas Hastings and Solomon Warriner. 2nd rev ed. Utica, ny 1819

The Psalmody Reformer. Compiled by Gideon Woolaver and John B. Wallace. Halifax 1858

The Seraph: a compilation of Anthems and Set Pieces, designed for the use of Churches and Singing Societies. Selected from eminent and approved authors. By M. Burnham. Toronto 1863

– Supplement to the Stoughton Collection. Boston 1829


Wyeth, John, compiler. Repository of Sacred Music. Harrisburg, Penn 1810
– Repository of Sacred Music, Part Second. Harrisburg, Penn 1813

NOTES


2. See Anne Burnham, and Ennals. Mark Burnham has sometimes been confused with his nephew, the Rev Mark Burnham (1804–87), an Anglican priest and missionary.


4. The correspondence of Bishop Stewart, in the Anglican Archives, Lennoxville, Quebec, contains no references regarding Colonial Harmonist, I am informed by the archivist, James Sweeny.

5. See Temperley, Music, ch 7. The author speaks of England during the period 1760–1830. Developments in small-town North America were comparable but less advanced.
6. The term 'First New England School' was first suggested in Hitchcock, 9ff. Hitchcock also borrows the term 'Yankee tunesmiths' from earlier historians.

7. Crawford, 'Ancient Music.' The author lists nine such publications in his table 3, and gives, in his footnote 20, titles of 101 tunes which appear in two or more of them. Of these titles, 63 also appear in Colonial Harmonist. (This statistic is less than solid, since the tunes themselves have not been compared: at this period the same tune often appears in various collections under different titles and the same title – 'Bath,' 'Cambridge,' 'Friendship' are examples – is often applied to different tunes. Nevertheless the evidence of Burnham's awareness of the reform movement is persuasive.)

8. The plan of the two volumes is also closely similar. In the Boston collection, the tunes are grouped by their metres, in the order lm, cm, and sm, and then tunes in miscellaneous special metres. Then follows a selection of more extended pieces. This is the plan adopted by Colonial Harmonist, as already noted. A difference occurs towards the end of the volumes: where the Boston Collection adds four vocal canons, Colonial Harmonist has a section devoted to chants.

9. The North American terms, derived from German musical nomenclature and espoused by German-trained teachers, were introduced starting in the 1840s.

10. Burnham says in his 'Advertisement' (Colonial Harmonist, 3), 'Wherever the same pieces have been found differently harmonized by different compilers, that tune has been selected, which can be sung with the greatest advantage.' But no exactly copied harmonizations or versions are traced in this or other contemporaneous sources, which suggests that his habit was to make his own adjustments, often minor but sometimes fairly significant, using his sense of performing practicality.

11. See below, page 635.


13. Briefly, the system replaced the conventional oval note-heads with a different shape for each of the four solmization syllables – a triangle for fa, a circle for sol, a square for la, and a diamond for mi – as an aid in sight-singing. The most popular shape-note tunebooks, Walker's Southern Harmony and White's Sacred Harp, remained in print in the 1990s.

14. See Wilson. The claim that Davidson composed some of the tunes in Sacred Harmony is questionable.

15. See Lamb. The preliminary announcement of Sacred Harmony, like that for Colonial Harmonist, mentions an expected endorsement from the Bishop of Quebec, but in neither case did this materialize.

16. Figures beneath the notes of the bass line, the baroque 'basso continuo,' were a standard shorthand indication from which a trained keyboard accompanist could play the appropriate chords.
17. This version of 'Resurrection' is reproduced in Beckwith, item 134b.

18. The three books have been traced to Mark Burnham. The seller in 2000, Julie Cotter of Port Hope, is the daughter of Stella Freeman, who in the 1950s acted as care-giver to the two elderly unmarried daughters of Henry H. Burnham, mayor of Port Hope 1890–93 and son of Mark Burnham; the 'Misses Burnham' presented these volumes along with a Burnham Bible to Mrs Freeman.

19. My consultations with u.s. psalmody scholars confirm this. Nym Cooke cites a number of 'typesetter manuscripts' from this period, while Karl Kroeger mentions others. A facsimile page from one example appears in Cooke's edition of the vocal music of Timothy Swan (see plate 4). The preserved cases appear to be all handwritten copies prepared for typesetting. Most such would have been discarded after their volumes were printed, but some survived. In the case of Truman S. Wetmore's Republican Harmony, a rural-Connecticut compilation thought to be from circa 1798 and now in the Newberry Library, the compiler's manuscript, like Burnham's 'second edition,' apparently never reached publication. For the precise 'cut and paste' preparation of a mock-up tunebook represented by Colonial Harmonist I have so far discovered no parallel.

20. Ingalls, 'Northfield'; Maxim, 'Turner' and 'Machias'; Read, 'Lisbon.'


22. To my untrained eye, these appear to be two versions of the same handwriting. The formation of capitals remains the same whether slanting or upright. The details of the music-copying – clefs, accidentals, beaming, and so on – are remarkably similar throughout, suggesting not only the same copyist but a concentrated period of production.

23. Trent University Archives, Peterborough, Ontario, Choate Family Papers, additions, 86-027-2-5.

24. This tune is William Miller's 'Plymouth Dock,' 1803. The 1824 fragment, if indeed by Mark Burnham, illustrates a less practised stage of his music copying than that in the 'mock-up.' But the handwriting of the texts closely resembles that in the 'mock-up,' as does the style of writing in both music and text of the three complete tunes at Trent.