William Billings
in the Southern Fasola Tunebooks, 1816–1855

David W. Music

Table 1
Key to Tunebooks

ANC Andrew Pink, The following Martyr’s Christ-Music (Hartford, 1829).
CGH Benjamin Shaw and Charles H. Spilman, Columbia Harmony (Cinci

nati, 1829).
CWH William Moore, Columbian Harmony (Cincinnati, 1825).
CDH J. D. McCallum and J. F. Campbell, The Countryland Harmony (Nash

ville, 1834).
ECR Andrew W. Robinson, Edictic Harmony (Shelbyville, Tenn., 1847).
GCM Joseph Furk, Genuine Church Music (Mountain Valley, Va., 1857).
HUI George Hendrickson, The Union Harmony (Mountain Valley, Va., 1846).
KST J. A. and I. W. R. Barber, The Kentucky Harmony (Cincinnati, 1829).
KNH John B. Jacobi, The Dossyville Harmony/Madisonville, Tenn., 1838.
KANK Ananas Davison, Kentucky Harmony (Harrodsburg, Ky., 1815–1817, 1820, 1822).
MOH Allen L. Carden, The Mississi Harmony (Cincinnati, 1829).
SCHR Ananas Davison, A Collection of Sacred Music (Harrodsburg, Ky., 1822).
SKH Ananas Davison, A Supplement to the Kentucky Harmony (Harrodsburg, Ky., 1820, 1825).
STL John B. Sear, The W. Louis Harmony (Cincinnati, 1831).
SVH John W. Stoffer, The Valley Harmony (Winchester, Va., 1849).
SFH William Walker, The Southern and Western Pocket Hymnbook (Philadel

phia, 1849).
TJ Alexander Johnson, Johnson’s Tennessee Harmony (Cincinnati, 1819, 1822, 1834).
UH William Carwell, Union Harmony (Maryville, Tenn., 1857).
USM Allen D. Carden, United States Sacred Harmony (Nashville, 1829).
VAM David L. Claytor and James P. Carroll, The Virginia Harmony (Winches
ter, Va., 1833, 1836).
VSM Wheeler Gillet, The Virginia Sacred Minstrel (Wichita, Ks., 1817).
VSMR James M. Boyd, The Virginia Sacred Musical Repository (Winchester,

Va., 1818).
WEP Allen D. Carden, S. J. Rogers, P. Moore, and J. Green, The Western Harmony (Nashville, 1824).

14 • Twelfth
### Table 2
Tunes Misattributed to William Billings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tune</th>
<th>Tunebooks</th>
<th>Actual composer</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Beddoes</td>
<td>COH25</td>
<td></td>
<td>In other southern fasola tunebooks this tune is printed anonymously and sometimes attributed to Dawson.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Delphin</td>
<td>SH25, IH48</td>
<td>Jacob French</td>
<td>Kroeger AFT #430.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Donors</td>
<td>KY16, 17, 21, 26; TH21, COH25, IH48</td>
<td>Timothy Swan</td>
<td>Harley, p. 163. &quot;Billings did not write Donors.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friendship</td>
<td>KY17</td>
<td></td>
<td>Attrib. to &quot;Little&quot; in KY16 &amp; 21; pr. as &quot;unknown&quot; in Little &amp; Smith, Easy Instructor; this is not the same tune as the Finances noted below.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harmony Vision</td>
<td>KY16, 17, 21, 26; UH5*</td>
<td></td>
<td>In other southern fasola tunebooks this tune is pr. anonymously; this is not the same tune as the Finances noted above.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harmony Vision</td>
<td>SOH55, 38, 47, 54; SAH44</td>
<td>Jacob French</td>
<td>Daniel, p. 122.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Moonlight</td>
<td>KY16, 17, 21, 26; UH57, IH48</td>
<td>Lucius Chapin (?)</td>
<td>Harley, p. 65. &quot;both the tune and the harmonic setting are closely in the Southern tradition.&quot; On the attrib. to Chapin see Shull, p. 35.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New York</td>
<td>KY126</td>
<td>Edward Harwood</td>
<td>This is Harwood's set piece The Down Catastas: 1st pub. in Harwood, Set of Hymns (1770) (Crawford CR #28).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes for Table 2

Only tunebooks that specifically attribute these tunes to Billings are listed in volume 2. Some of the tunes appeared in other southern fasola tunebooks with different attributions or none at all. Numbers given after the tunebook sigla are the last two digits of the year of publication; thus, "SH25" is the 1825 edition of Anasaw Dawson's Supplement to the Kentucky Harmony.


*The four tunebooks that apparently did not contain any Billings tunes were: ANC, NAC, T&DH, and YDMM.*

It should be pointed out that there were several tunebooks for which no copy of any edition was available for examination. Thus, the present study should be viewed as a preliminary report.


Tim Hess * 15
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tune</th>
<th>Fasola Tunebooks</th>
<th>First Printing</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ahnert</td>
<td>RHST20, 26 (W. Billings)</td>
<td>NEPS</td>
<td>Koege #30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>STA2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>VAM18</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>JH448 (Billings)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SAH50 (Billings)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SCH54 (Billings)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fisk</td>
<td>WES24 (Billings)</td>
<td>PSA</td>
<td>Koege #24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>BR5720, 26 (W. Billings)</td>
<td>NEPS</td>
<td>Koege #37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CGM32</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gilchrist</td>
<td>NH48 (Billings)</td>
<td>NEPS</td>
<td>Koege #50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David's Laboratory</td>
<td>KYH10, 17, 21, 26 (W. Billings)</td>
<td>SMA</td>
<td>Koege #205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TH93, 21, 24</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>VMO18</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>RHST20, 26</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MOH20</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>WES24 (Billings)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>COH25 (W. Billings)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>UH120 (Billings)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ST187</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SOH5 (Billings), 16 (no arr.), 47, 54 (Billings)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ANH83 (W. Billings)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>KN158</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>AMH89</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SAD4 (Billings)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ECLIP</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>HH48</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>HU148</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SOC55</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Living Christ</td>
<td>SHS15 (The Living Christ)</td>
<td>PSA</td>
<td>Koege #305</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Easter Anthems</td>
<td>KYH15, 17 (W. Billings), 21, (William Billings), 26 (Billings)</td>
<td>Indep.</td>
<td>Koege #329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TH185 (Billings); 21, 24</td>
<td>pub. 1787</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>RHST20, 26 (Billings)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MOH20</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>WES24 (Billings)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>COH25 (Billings)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SCH54 (Billings)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CH129</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SOH55, 56, 47, 54 (Billings)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>JHS7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>RH58</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SAH54 (Billings)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SVH14</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>HHH16 (Billings)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SOC55 (Billings)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3 lists the tunes by Billings that appeared in the southern Fasola Tunebooks. The tune names appear in the forms given them by the composer. The second column indicates which tunebooks in which the pieces appeared—identified by the sign from Table 1—together with the attribution and any source notes that were used when making corrections. The third column notes the first publication of Billings’s tunes, while column four gives miscellaneous information about the publication, including the number of the tune in Koege’s catalogue of Billings’s works. The extent of Billings’s influence on the southern Fasola Tunebooks can be seen from the data presented in Tables 3 and 5. Slightly more than 15 percent of the tunebooks investigated included at least one Billings tune. Thirty-one different Billings pieces can be found in these collections, with a total of 135 printings. One volume, Finis M. Harmon’s Holy War, included 15 tunes by Billings, while John B. Scott’s A Spiritual Hymnbook used at least 19. Ten other collections published a total of five to ten of Billings’s works. By a composer being included well over a decade before any of these tunebooks were published, these are respectable figures indeed. However, the numbers do not account for some causes. It should be noted that four Billings pieces—the anthems—received 10 or more publication each. Examinations (19 publications), David’s Laboratory (18), Fanny’s Anthems (13), and Ross of New (11). These works alone account for nearly half (42%) of the total number of Billings publications in the southern Fasola Tunebooks. Not a single “congregational-type” (gospel, hymn, or fagon) tune reached double digits; the congregational-type tunes that had the largest number of publications, Messiah and Savorious, achieved a mere seven appearances each, while none of the others were found five times or less. Thus, apart from his four popular anthems, Billings’s influence in the southern Fasola Tunebooks can be said to have been wide rather than deep, particularly where music for the congregational repertoire was concerned.

Sources of the Tunes

The following discussion is in the form of a commentary on the information presented in Table 3. This commentary is concerned primarily with two aspects of the Billings tunes that appear in the southern Four-Shape books: 1) the possible sources from which Southern Fasola composers derived these tunes and 2) the transmission of the Billings tunes from the southern Tunebook to others of the same kind.

No attempt has been made to examine every printing of Billings tunes in northern tunebooks issued before 1816. Instead, six representative volumes of Southern Fasola Tunebooks were chosen for study. The general conclusions reached are based on the evidence discovered in these books. 16

16: Nat. Hist.
northern tunebooks have been selected for closer examination—Amos Fishburn, United States' Sacred Harmony (1799); Nehemiah Shumway, The American Harmony (2nd ed., 1803); Asaiah Foles, Delaware Harmony (1805); John Wyeth, Repository of Sacred Music (1810); John Wyeth, Repository of Sacred Music, Part Second (1815); and Freeman Lewis, Beauties of Harmony (1816). The settings of Billings tunes in these collections have been compared with those in the tunebooks listed in Table 3 to determine which (if any) could have served as sources for the southern four-shape compilers. Obviously, if the same settings appeared in other northern collections the southern compilers might have relied upon them other than the six employed here. Indeed, it is certain that southern compilers had access to many more northern tunebooks than these six. Nevertheless, in many cases it seems reasonably certain that the southern compilers borrowed Billings tunes from one of these six tunebooks and not directly from the collections by Wyeth and Lewis. In a few instances, a Billings tune printed in one or more southern falsa volumes does not appear in any of the six tunebooks and a wider net has been cast to examine other printings of the tune to other early northern tunebooks.

The tracing of sources in southern falsa tunebooks is often an uncertain process. For example, the presence or absence of chromatic signs can sometimes point one to a likely source. However, some compilers—such as Asaiah Davison—routine-ly excluded all accidents from their tunebooks; thus, one cannot always use a chromatic feature as a gauge in determining the source of a Billings tune.
particular tune. Furthermore, some compilations—
Davidson's is an example—appear to be
based on earlier publications. The lack of a
more comprehensive bibliography suggests that
the compiler was not aware of the sources he
used. The following is a list of the tunes
included in the manuscript:

- SMIH 18 (S.M. Hill)
- SH144 (Pseudonym)
- HGH4 (Pseudonym)

- WES 2 (W. Billings)
- STH44 (S. Thames)
- TH12 (Billings)
- SH144 (Billings)
- SMIH 5 (Billings)
- SH144 (Billings)
- HGH4 (Billings)
- SOC 5 (Billings)

- KTH 5 (Billings)
- SK 5 (Billings)
- SM 5 (S. Thames)
- COM 25 (S. Thames)
- STL 5 (S. Thames)
- SOH 5 (S. Thames)

- ST 3 (Huntington)
- ST 3 (Huntington)
- ST 3 (Huntington)
- ST 3 (Huntington)
- ST 3 (Huntington)
- ST 3 (Huntington)
- ST 3 (Huntington)

- SMIH 18 (S. Thames)
- SMIH 18 (S. Thames)
- SMIH 18 (S. Thames)
- SMIH 18 (S. Thames)
- SMIH 18 (S. Thames)
- SMIH 18 (S. Thames)
- SMIH 18 (S. Thames)

- SH144 (S. Thames)
- SH144 (S. Thames)
- SH144 (S. Thames)
- SH144 (S. Thames)
- SH144 (S. Thames)
- SH144 (S. Thames)
- SH144 (S. Thames)

The manuscript is a valuable resource for
students of American music and
scholars interested in the history of
music in America.
The text on the page appears to be a continuation of a discussion about music, specifically mentioning the compositions of William Byrd and the use of his works in the context of a manuscript repository. The text references Byrd's collection and attempts to reconstruct the original manuscripts based on the repository's holdings. It also touches on the historical accuracy of these reconstructions and the reliability of the repository's records.

Here is a possible transcription of the text:

"The text on the page appears to be a continuation of a discussion about music, specifically mentioning the compositions of William Byrd and the use of his works in the context of a manuscript repository. The text references Byrd's collection and attempts to reconstruct the original manuscripts based on the repository's holdings. It also touches on the historical accuracy of these reconstructions and the reliability of the repository's records."
Hawser's Harpian was a local species of the Northern White-Crowned Sparrow. Hawser's Harpian was a local species of the Northern White-Crowned Sparrow. Hawser's Harpian was a local species of the Northern White-Crowned Sparrow. Hawser's Harpian was a local species of the Northern White-Crowned Sparrow. Hawser's Harpian was a local species of the Northern White-Crowned Sparrow. Hawser's Harpian was a local species of the Northern White-Crowned Sparrow. Hawser's Harpian was a local species of the Northern White-Crowned Sparrow. Hawser's Harpian was a local species of the Northern White-Crowned Sparrow.
The tune HATFIELD as found in Shumway's *American Harmony* (1801, top) and White and King's *Sacred Harp* (1850).


---

**HATFIELD. C. M.**

Arranged by B. F. White.

Naked as from the earth we came, And empty to life at first, We to the earth re-turn as gold, And mingle with our dust.

The sun on earth we here re-joy, And cheerily call our own, And in the hum of heaven's love, To be is paid a tern.
of the Sacred Harp includes no mention of Bills, only that the tune was "Arranged by B. F. White." The lack of reference to Billings and the fact that White's version appears to be closer to the Shumway printing than to that in the A. 1804 edition of the Psalm-Singer's Amusement suggests that White knew the tune only from Shumway's volume. In his revision, White omitted the treble and bass parts, and completely rewrote the treble.

HAGMAN (see New Hampshire)

JONESTON (see PETERSBURG)

JONES

The majority of the southern tunebooks that included this piece seem to have favored the setting published by Lewis. These include the printings in Merri! s Kentucky Harmaniest, Carden's Missouri Harmaniest, and the Genuine Church Music, and Hauer's Harmaniest. Alexander Johnson and Collins and Campbell selected the version found in Weyth's Repository for their Tennessee Harmaniest (1824) and Cumberland Harmaniest (1854) respectively.

KENTUCKY

The only known southern facsimile printing of Krnkm in Seat St. Louis Harmaniest, is identical to that in Lewis's Beauties of Harmony, from which it was probably derived.

LIBRARY

Either Lewis or Weyth's Repository (or both) probably revived the source for Davison's publication of Lewis. These three printings are the earliest except for Davison's choice of a different text and his placing of the counter in treble clef.

MASSACHUSETTS

Davison undoubtedly borrowed his setting of Massie from Weyth's Repository, merely changing the counter part, revising the treble and bass, and altering the quarter and eighth note. From Carden the tune was taken over without alteration into Hauer's Harmaniest. The only composer who seems not to have followed Weyth's counter is Meullcr, whose Kentucky Harmaniest of 1820 printed the tune as found in Lewis, minus the bass part (1804, counter: m. 5).

MARYLAND

The most likely source for the setting in Maryland in the Kentucky Harmaniest was Weyth's Repository. In addition to omitting all accidentals and placing the counter in treble clef, Davison seems to have rewritten portions of Weyth's counter. For most of the publications by southern composers vary considerably both from one another and from earlier printings of the tune. The publications by Johnson, Carden, Clayton and Carrell, Funk and Shaw and Spilman all include the tune Massie and used the same text ("Vain, delusive world, adieu.") This suggests a possible linkage between them, but only the Johnson, Carden, and Shaw/Spilman collections can be suitably compared with one another. One of the few source tunebooks that included this tune the Pilbury printing appears to be closest to the Johnson/Carden/Shaw/Spilman version. These differ from Pilbury mainly in the alteration of rhythmical figures, the placement of accidentals, and the use or number of choosing notes. The Clayton and Carrell collections have a simple extra tiple treble part and numerous other variations from earlier printings of the tune, while the source from which Joseph Funk extracted is also a matter of question. The printings in the Clayton/Carden and Funk tunebooks probably represent extensive revisions by the respective compilers.

James M. Boyd probably also drew upon Pilbury for his setting of Massie in the Virginia Sacred Musical Repository, though he titled the tune Jesus. Nevertheless, Boyd's version is closer to that in Pilbury than to many of the other early tunebooks consulted for this study.

Both a third text and style were linked with Massie in Steffy's Valley Harmoniest. In this case the text was "Mary in God's Saviour's tomb" and the title was Mass. The setting shows little similarity to earlier ones and was probably an extensive rearrangement by Steffy himself.

MICHIGAN

The history of this tune partly use in southern. Mnichigian facetunebooks is somewhat confusing, a situation that may in part be traced to Billings himself.

The composer wrote a different version on the verse and subsequently revised it, calling the altered version New Michigan. He then published both tunes in the New England Psalmist, though Billings seems to have ignored Ingemus, for he never repeated it. New Michigan, on the other hand, was substantially revised again and printed in the Singing Master's Assistant and Music to Minister, after which it was published in many a dozen pre-1850 American tunebooks. However, in two or pre-1830 printings, Pilbury's United States Harmaniest, and Davison's Delaware Harmaniest, the music of New Michigan (in the revised SMA, MSV version) appeared under the title Harvard. Apart from the elimination of all accidentals and the squaring-up of a few dotted rhythms, R. F. White's publication of the tune called this (which is named Harvard in the 1859 edition of the Sacred Harp differs from that of Pilbury only in the elimination of two choosing notes in m. 5 of the treble, there can be little question that White borrowed this tune from Pilbury's collection.

Under the variant title New Massachusetts, New Michigan appeared in four other southern facsimile tunebooks.

Vol. 27, No. 4. October 1936
When Hauser saw fit to include the tune in his Hesperian Harp he undoubtedly used the Sacred Harp as his source. White and King, Hauser printed the tune without attribution and titled it Pettisiana. He also added a choosing note and its sharp in the treble (mm. 6 and 27 respectively) and altered one rhythm in the bass (mm. 16). However, Hauser must also have had access to another publication of the tune since he incorporated the repeat marks that White and King had omitted.12

It seems likely that the Carden printing was based upon that in Weyth's Repository, Part Second, except for the meter signature (common time in Weyth, cut time in Carden), the two versions are identical, down to the use of both bass clef for the counter part. In turn, White and King probably borrowed Pettisiana from Carden, the compilers of the Sacred Harp made a few changes, but these do not affect the basic similarities of the two printings. Of course, White and King could also have taken the tune directly from Weyth rather than from Carden, though this seems unlikely.

The source from which Alexander Johnson drew the tune is evident from his attribution of Pettisiana to "Philsbury's Col." Furthermore, the Pettisiana and Johnson settings are identical except for the latter's omission of a few decorative devices and all choosing notes in the bass. Johnson's book may have served as the source for White and King, who eliminated the remaining chromatic signs, placed the counter in treble clef, and gave the third note of mm. 4 in the counter clef.

The source for Alexander Davison's setting of Rose of Sharon cannot be established. There is a strong possibility that he relied mainly upon the printing by Billings himself in the Singing Master's Assistant, but also made use of the version found in Weyth's Repository. Apart from the addition of decorative devices, the new version is not significantly different from that in the Singing Master's Assistant; it only places the counter part in bass clef and in two staves in the treble (m. 27, mm. 2, and mm. 8, 25), note 4. Davison made a few changes in rhythm and figure, the use of choosing notes, and some evident mireprints, the music of the Davison version differs from that in the Singing Master's Assistant only in placing the counter part in bass clef and in two staves in the treble (m. 27, mm. 2, and mm. 8, 25), note 4. Davison might also have called Shumway's tunebook. The primary evidence for this is the common use by Davison and Shumway of the word "vally" in the last line of the text: Billings, Weyth, and Lewis all gave the word as "valley." The most influential southern printing of Rose of Sharon was that in Carde's Missouri Harp, for it seems to have served as the progenitor of most subsequent publications of the song in the region. Cardes version closely resembles that from the Kentucky Harmony. Most

The plenitude of the repeat marks clearest the Virginia Sacred Musical Repository from consideration, also because in Hauser they were "correctly" placed at the point in which they appeared in the Suffolk Harmony.
of the differences revolve around choosing colors and rhythmic figures; there are two points in the tempera at which pitch differences occur located in m. 53. Carden (see Weyer) gives the inner note as a ¹ in the tenor on the ², and as ² in the tenor, m. 133 on the ⁴, and one is printed as ⁴ and the other as ². These changes can probably be attributed to Carden himself.

The arrangement of Ross of Shawoos was subsequently published without impediment in Johnson's *Tennessee Harmony* and Moore's *Columbian Harmony* (the latter with notes inadvertently omitted in the tenor, m. 61, and bass, m. 135). The *Tennessee Harmony* seems to have been the basis for the printing in Walker's *Southern Harmony*, which is passed through White's and King's *Sacred Harp* into McCreary's *Social Harp.* ² Right probably borrowed Ross or Shaw of Carden (or from another manuscript that followed Carden's arrangement) for his *Valley Harmony*, omitting the counter part and making a few other alterations. Another publication of this anthem that was likely based on the Carden arrangement was that in Huser's *Harpist Harp*.

Two later Southern family publications of Shawoos did not follow the *Missouri Harmony* scoring. Both of these were by Carden, who reproduced the version found in Lewkow's *Sacred Harp* for his Western Harmony and United States Harmony.

**Savannah**

In Davidson's *Kentucky Harmony*, Shawoos appears as a form similar to that found in Stumway except that two notes in the treble part were altered (m. 12) and the counter part was eliminated—probably by David Hunter himself. Even though the outline of the old part is still visible. However, there is an indication in the text that Davidson might have also had Lewkow's book before him as he was arranging Shawoos, the first part in both and Lewis is a "O" while in Stumway it is an "A."

Significantly, after its appearance in the *Kentucky Harmony*, Shawoos does not appear to have been published under this title in any later Southern family collection except *Seal's Ohio Harmony,* which incorporates two different versions, one named Shawoos, the other Union (after the new text with which it was linked, Thomas Baldwin's *From whence both (this union arose).* Seal probably drew Shawoos from the fifth edition of *A New Ohio Harmony* (1820).

The revision of Shawoos and the title *Union* may have been the work of Aaran Davidson, who published Shawoos in his Supplement to the *Kentucky Harmony,* transposed down a minor third from Shawoos and attributed to "Billings."

The rough printing of the text is consistent but in different versions for both Shawoos and the *Kentucky Harmony* except that the sharp sign was transcribed from the bass to the ⁴. However, the other voices were completely rewritten and bear little or no relationship to those of earlier printings. The Supplement is the *Kentucky Harmony* version was repeated in Davidson's *Small Collection of Sacred Music* with the counter part included in Shawoos's *Harpist Harp.* William Moore borrowed his scoring in the *Columbian Harmony* from Davidson's *Supple- ment* and is probably the same that is found in *Seal's St. Louis Harmony* and *Walker's Southern Harmony.*

*Storus* (which is perhaps not by Billings) appeared in the 1819 *Missouri Harmony,* as well as in *Seal's St. Louis Harmony.* This printing was almost certainly borrowed from Lewkow's *Sacred Harp.*

**Schoro**

Schoro initially appeared in Billings's *lost* *New* *Sacred* *Harp* where it was titled "West Schoro" and copied on the index to *Storus* (a different tune from this collection). Schoro was reprinted in *Storus* and is discussed below. Of course the 1819 compiler, Abraham Mayes, seems to have picked up the tune, rephrasing it in various versions of his *Northern Harmony* (1855-1881), but always under the incorrect title "West Schoro."

Thus, it seems likely that when *Annals Harmony* included the tune in his *Supplement to the Kentucky Harmony* (1826) under the title *Storus* he must have taken it directly from *The Continental Harmony.* A comparison of the settings in these two notebooks reveals a few discrepancies, but none of the anomalies are as obvious as those found in *Billings's* *Sacred Harp* setting. Davidson eliminated choosing notes that were found in *Billings,* gave the counter voice an independent role, and added a new final cadence. More significant were a few pitch changes, but these likely represented changes to the *Storus* version that was not found in "California." The source used by John B. Seal in his publication of this song in *Seal's St. Louis Harmony* is not known. The placing of the counter part in tenor and the elimination of the multiple endings (plus the repeat mark) suggests the use of *Storus.* The other changes made by Seal and *Storus* do not appear in *Seal* (though the sforzando note of m. 9 in the bass is incorrectly printed in both parts and shape as a D) Seal has worked from more than one source of the tune. The *Storus* version included here is probably published because *Storus* is the *Sacred Harp* version that was reprinted in the *State Printer's* *Sacred Harp.*

*Polyphonic United States Sacred Harp* is the probable source for the song's single known publication in a southern four-part notebook:

Vol. 47, No. 4 October 1996
punk's Genuine Church Music. Punk omitted the counter part and used a different text, but otherwise his publication of Sümke is identical to that by Pilhury.

THOMAS TOWN

The only southern fasola tunebook known to have included this piece was Seat's St. Louis Harmony. Since this printing uses the same variant title found in Lewis's Beauties of Harmony (Thompson) and the music is identical in the two books the source used by Seat appears to be self-evident.

THOMAS TOWN (see Thomas Town)

UNEON (see Swinburn)

VERMONT

Alexander Johnson probably copied Vawser from Weyth's Repository, Part Second for his Vermont Harmony since the two settings are identical. Carden's printing in the Missouri Harmony varies only slightly from Johnson's (and Weyth's), suggesting that he borrowed the tune from one of these two earlier compilers. The Carden publication, in turn, was almost surely carried over into White and King's Sacred Harp, and it includes the one alteration made by Carden in the Weyth/Johnson version (bars. m. 10). This alteration is found again in Hauser's Harperrner Harp, implying a borrowing from White and King or, less likely, from Carden. Hauser made a few slight revisions, deleting the accidentals found in earlier printings and placing the counter in treble clef.

WAVER

Hauser's source for Waver cannot be present determined, his printing uses a different text from earlier appearances and includes variations in the parts that are not known from other tunebooks. Hauser also eliminated Billings's counter part and printed the tune without attribution.

WASHINGTON

The precise source from which Boyd drew Wawson has not yet been determined since the Virginia Sacred Musical Repository publication differs in several respects from all known earlier appearances. Two of these differences involve pitches: 1) treble part, m. 7, note 3 is D♯ in VSMR, but D in earlier printings; 2) counter part, m. 22, note 2 is A♯ not G.

WASHINGTON

Wax Scores does not appear in any of the six source tunebooks used for this study. The two publications by Carden are identical. Furthermore, they are the same in all essentials as the printing in the Continental Harmony, suggesting that Carden might have made this tune directly from Billings. It is reasonable to assume that John B. Seat took Wax Scores from one of Carden's collections, and that Andrew Johnson most likely did the same for his American Harmony, though he eliminated all accidentals. Johnson himself probably revised the tune for its appearance in the Eclectic Harmony, dating the first word of the text from "here" to "there," eliminating the first ending, placing the counter in treble clef and making a slight revision of the part in m. 7, and eliminating a choosing note in m. 8 of the bass.

Conclusion

The music of William Billings continued to figure prominently in the four-shape step-note tunebooks of the southern United States long after it had passed out of common use in the urban north. Most of the Billings works printed by southerners in the early-nineteenth century appear to have been filtered through northern tunebooks other than those issued by the composer himself, but a few southern publications probably came directly from one of Billings's own collections. While the bulk of Billings's influence in the fasola tunebooks was due to the popularity of four works in anthem form, these and other of his pieces at least shared his name alive in the living repertory of southern singing schools and churches. Hopefully, present and future hymnal committees, leaders of congregational singing, and choir directors will continue to seek appropriate material for the church service from the works of William Billings.

\[3\]

*It should be noted, however, that both Gardin and White King published Vawser anonymously, while Hauser announced it to Billings. Thus, Hauser's freedom with other parts of the tune may be assumed; he might well have taken his settings from the Sacred Harp (or Missouri Harmony) but deleted the attribution from someone else.

*The only difference was an added choosing note in the bass (m. 8) and the changing of the bass note in the second ending in the appropriate octave of which could very well have been the work of Carden himself.

*See the discussion of Enner, Pemberton, State of Simon, Silver, and Wawson.